
Effectiveness of the Implementation of Outcomes Based Education (OBE) in the College of International Tourism and Hospitality Management

Asia Pacific Journal of
Education Perspective
Vol. 8 No. 2, 1-9
December 2021
ISSN 2782-8557

Dr. Sevilla S. Felicen

Lyceum of the Philippines University - Batangas
sfelicen@lpubatangas.edu.ph

Date Received: October 28, 2021; Date Revised: December 3, 2021; Date Accepted: December 16, 2021

Abstract – *Content-based curriculum, policies of teaching, learning, and assessment, the lack of basic infrastructure and info-structure, lack of facilities, and teachers' workload are among the key challenges towards implementing an Outcomes Based Education approach. This study aimed to assess the effectiveness of the implementation of OBE in the College of International Hospitality and Tourism Management for the students enrolled in the first semester of 2019-2020 in terms of relevance of the course, course organization, teaching and learning activities; assessment method, learning environment and counselling; tested the significant difference on the effectiveness of OBE when grouped according to program and proposed an action plan based on the results of the study. The study used descriptive design with 3445 responses from the student total population. Frequency, percentage distribution, weighted mean, ranking, Shapiro-Wilk and Kruskal Wallis was used to test the result of the study. The study revealed that student participants assessed the implementation of Outcomes Based Education as highly effective in the aspects of relevance of the course specifically in the indicator the course helped the student develop relevant subject. For teachers and teaching-learning activities, teachers motivated the students to learn according to the assessment of travel and tourism management and Cruiseline operation in hotel services programs. It was found out that highly significant difference was obtained in the assessment of effectiveness of OBE when grouped according to program/specialization and found that students under hotel and restaurant administration considered the implementation most effective. An action plan was proposed to have continuous implementation of OBE and to achieve its perfect implementation.*

Keywords: *Outcomes Based Education, Tourism and Hospitality Management*

Cite this article as: Felicen, S.S., (2021). Effectiveness of the Implementation of Outcomes Based Education (OBE) in the College of International Tourism and Hospitality Management, *Asia Pacific Journal of Educational Perspectives*, 8(2), 1-9

INTRODUCTION

Outcome Based Education (OBE) is one of the most significant developments in education in recent years and has been practiced worldwide since 1990s. It is currently of much potential in the global educational landscape [1]. It is one of the accepted and successful educational systems in many countries including the U.S., U.K., New Zealand, Malaysia, Australia, South Africa, and the Philippines, and currently embraced in over 47 countries around the globe [2]. Outcome based approach is a shift of teaching learning paradigm from teacher centric to student centric. It involves directing all efforts of an education system on what is crucial for all learners to succeed after the learning experience [3]. This also involves relevance of the course, course organization, teaching and learning activities; assessment method, learning environment and counselling [4].

In the implementation of OBE, the courses that will be taken must be relevant to the program enrolled in providing up-to-date developments regarding technology and emerging knowledge. The evaluation process must assess the rate of student learning growth as the source of knowledge for further development opportunities. The learning environment relates to the different physical environments, context, and culture by which learners study. More so, it must have a counselling that is part of the needs of youth and the adolescents in terms of attitude, beliefs, and potential solution for the problem.

The Philippines has started such paradigm shift, referred to as outcomes-based education (OBE), in which the focus is not on the teacher or the expert, but on the learners, not on content or instruction, but on the outcomes. In a nutshell, CHED defines OBE as “an approach that focuses and organizes the educational system around what is essential for all learners to know, value, and be able to do to achieve the desired level of competence.” With OBE, there will be an “appropriate assessment of student performance. OBE will not only make it easier for students and workers to move across

ASEAN for employment, but more importantly it will raise the quality of education in the country [5].

OBE is being practiced and implemented in Lyceum of the Philippines University – Batangas (LPU-B) for ten years now as it started in 2011. LPU-B like many other universities around Asia, deals with rapid and continuous challenges brought about by technological advancements and global demands. Furthermore, due to the difficulties of paths regarded to trace OBE's effectiveness showing it in fact develops the student learning outcomes; critics are in opposition to it. In a positive note, high level of knowledge and understanding of faculty members on the implementation of OBE have also higher possibility to contribute to the realization of the intents of OBE through application. In relation to this, lecturers are concerned highly in the implementation of the OBE that deals with the number of students to align intended learning outcomes and activities towards learning which require time, effort, and resources.

It was revealed that OBE as a process, curricular approach, a student center approach, needs time and materials, preparation for students lifelong learning and grounded outcomes. However, the barriers are moderately met in OBE implementation where insufficient means and materials for laboratory work and unestablished institution's outcomes-based teaching and learning delivery system [6].

Since CITHM is undergoing continuous or series of national and international accreditation like International Center of Excellence in Tourism and Hospitality Education (THE-ICE) and Asia Pacific Institute of Events Management (APIEM), it is necessary to come up with a study for the continuous improvement of the program. This study was conducted to determine the implementation of OBE in the College of International Tourism and Hospitality Management. The result of this study will be beneficial to the college because it will serve as basis in their effort of providing quality education to the students.

OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY

This study aimed to assess the effectiveness of the implementation Outcomes Based Education as perceived CITHM students enrolled in the first semester of 2019-2020. Specifically, it intended to determine the effectiveness of the implementation of OBE in terms of relevance of the course, course organization, teaching and learning activities; assessment method, learning environment and counseling and test the significant difference on the

effectiveness of OBE when grouped according to program.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Research Design

This research used descriptive design to assess the effectiveness of the implementation of OBE by College of International Tourism and Hospitality Management students.

Participants

The participants of the study were the International Travel and Tourism Management and Hospitality Management students enrolled during the first semester of 2019-2020. There were 3445 responses from among the total student population. This was due to multiple responses when students assessed the different courses they are enrolled in.

Instrument

The instrument of this study was an adopted questionnaire from the standard survey questionnaire used by Lyceum of the Philippines University – Batangas in the assessment of Outcomes Based Education. The questionnaire is divided into six areas namely relevance of the course, course organization, teacher - teaching and learning activities, assessment method, learning environment and counseling.

Procedure

The data were gathered using google form. The students were given the link to access the google form thru their respective advisers. Students answered the questionnaire a week before their scheduled final exam. The study used 100 percent of the total population.

Ethical Considerations

During the gathering of data, students were assured that the information gathered will be treated with utmost confidentiality and will be used only for the purpose of this research. No names were mentioned, only that they were CITHM students. No opinion was given by the researchers about the information and results based on the data gathered.

Data Analysis

To perform data analysis, the following statistical tools were used. Frequency and percentage distribution were used to describe the demographic profile of the respondents. Weighted mean and ranking were used to assess the effectiveness of OBE. The

result of Shapiro-Wilk Test revealed that p-values of four major variables were less than 0.05 which means that the data set is not normally distributed. Therefore, Kruskal Wallis test for three groups were used as part of the non-parametric tests to determine the significant differences. The following Likert Scale was used in

assessing the variables: 3.50-4.00 – Highly Effective; 2.50-3.49 – Effective; 1.50 – 2.49 – Less Effective; and 1.00 – 1.49 – Not Effective. In addition, all data were treated using a statistical software known as PASW version 26 to further interpret the result of the study using an alpha level of 0.05.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Table 1. Effectiveness of OBE Implementation as Assessed by International Travel & Tourism Management Students

Relevance of the Course	WM	VI	Rank
1. The course helped me to develop relevant subject knowledge.	3.73	HE	1
2. The course helped me to develop related practical skills.	3.68	HE	4
3. The course helped me to develop team working skills.	3.66	HE	5
4. The course helped me to develop leadership skills.	3.61	HE	6
5. The course helped me to develop communication skills.	3.68	HE	3
6. The course helped me to develop positive attitude on my program of study.	3.71	HE	2
Composite Mean	3.68	HE	
Course Organization and ILOs			
1. The course was implemented according to the approved curriculum.	3.65	HE	1
2. Intended learning outcomes (ILOs) of the course were made known from the beginning.	3.61	HE	3
3. Intended learning outcomes (ILOs) of the course were clear.	3.61	HE	4
4. Intended learning outcomes (ILOs) of the course were relevant.	3.62	HE	2
5. There were no overlapping of contents within a course.	3.60	HE	5
Composite Mean	3.62	HE	
Teachers and TLAs			
1. Teaching – Learning Activities (TLAs) such as practical, educational tour, etc. were useful and relevant.	3.64	HE	3
2. Independent Learning (ILs) activities such as journal reading, research work, project, etc. were useful and relevant.	3.62	HE	4
3. The TLAs within a course were sequenced in a logical manner.	3.60	HE	6
4. Team teaching is done as applicable.	3.60	HE	7
5. The teachers motivated the students to learn.	3.66	HE	1
6. The teachers provided adequate opportunities for teamwork.	3.62	HE	5
7. The teachers provided adequate opportunities for independent learning.	3.64	HE	2
Composite Mean	3.63	HE	
Assessment			
1. Assessment methods to be used were told at the beginning of the course.	3.64	HE	1
2. Assessments covered all the main topics taught in the course.	3.63	HE	2
3. The number of assessments was appropriate and adequate.	3.60	HE	3
4. Distribution of assessments over a semester was appropriate.	3.60	HE	4
5. Allocation of marks / grade among assessments was satisfactory.	3.60	HE	5
6. The teachers provided timely feedback on student performance.	3.59	HE	6
Composite Mean	3.61	HE	
Learning environment			
1. Available facilities in the classrooms were satisfactory.	3.61	HE	2
2. Available library facilities were adequate.	3.61	HE	1
3. Available laboratory facilities were adequate.	3.56	HE	3
4. Access to computer facilities were sufficient.	3.56	HE	4
5. There was sufficient access to internet and electronic databases.	3.53	HE	6
6. Availability of facilities for recreation was adequate.	3.55	HE	5
Composite Mean	3.73	HE	
Counselling			
1. The teachers were available for consultation whenever needed.	3.60	HE	1
2. Academic counseling was available when needed.	3.57	HE	2
3. Counseling on non-academic matters was available when needed.	3.55	HE	3
Composite Mean	3.57	HE	
Over-all Composite Mean	3.61	HE	

Legend: 3.50 – 4.00 = Highly Effective (HE) ; 2.50 – 3.49 = Effective (E); 1.50 – 2.49 = Less Effective (LE); 1.00 – 1.49 = Not Effective (NE)

Table 1 shows the effectiveness of the Travel and Tourism Management (ITT) students as implementation of OBE as assessed by International highly effective with the over-all composite mean of

3.61. Learning environment (3.73) ranked the highest followed by relevance of the course (3.68) and third, teachers and teaching-learning activities (3.63) assessed as highly effective.

The implementation of OBE in the ITTM program was highly effective in terms of working environment because there are adequate facilities in the classroom, library, CITHM and computer laboratory. There is sufficient access to the internet and electronic devices that gives the student a good leaning environment. Through the implementation of OBE, more learners are engaged in their educational accomplishment at learning institutions. LPU provides state of the art facilities such as mock - up hotel rooms, front office, travel bureau and kitchen laboratory and computer laboratory with Micros Opera system. These make students enjoy their stay in the university as a memorable experience. Outcomes based education gives emphasis on establishing a quality learning environment that enable students to attain intended learning outcomes. Students are presumed to engage in a knowledgeable environment that highlights interactions and relationships between learners and educators.

One of the most important when designing and implementing a curriculum with an OBE approach, is the development of the right learning environment, which lets students engage in cooperative learning, practices skills in expanded opportunities, and enables different ideas to be integrated into practice [7].

However, course organization and Intended learning outcomes (3.62), assessment (3.61) and the lowest, counselling with 3.57 still rated as highly effective. Even though counselling ranked the lowest, there were available staff available for consultation whenever needed by the students.

LPU provides counselling services to students specially those who are having concerns on academics that affect their performance. The Counseling and Testing Center or CATC actively promotes the university image through the implementation of innovative and effective career guidance, testing programs, and dynamic student-friendly counseling services aimed to increase students' admission, satisfaction, and retention rate.

The fact that implies guidance counseling service helped students in career choice and development and improvement of their interpersonal skills as they promote study habits which can improve student's academic performance. The counseling and guidance services encourage the students to study very

hard, develop positive attitude toward learning, improve their class attendance and help them to approach exams without fear [8].

Table 2 presents the effectiveness of the implementation of Outcomes Based Education as assessed by International Hospitality Management students. As to Culinary Arts and Kitchen Operation students they assessed the implementation fo of OBE as highly effective with the over-all composite mean of 3.69. Relevance of the course topped on the rank with the composite mean of 3.73 followed by assessment with 3.71 and third, teachers and teaching learning activities with 3.70. In the implementation of OBE, the courses taken by the CAKO students can help them develop relevant subject knowledge and practical, communication and leadership skills as well as teamwork.

The importance of OBE in the course is that students gained more self-reliance and build new strength in conditions of field of specialization. The result of OBE affects the deeds and quality of students to develop their skills and talents in Culinary Arts through the courses offered in the program such as culinary nutrition, principles of food production, principles of safety hygiene and sanitation, food and beverage service operations, front office operations, computer system for front office, beverage products and operations, housekeeping operations, catering and banquet operations, culinary nutrition, principles of safety hygiene and sanitation, food and beverage service operations, food and beverage control, introduction to pastry and bakery, western cuisine, Asian cuisine, advance patisserie and plated dessert, catering and banquet operations as well as vegetable and fruit carving.

Relevance of the course in OBE focuses on the alignment of the learning activities with the skills, abilities, and knowledge that a student is expected to possess at the accomplishment of the course. It was pointed out that the method of outcome-based education (OBE) is the part of the system that prepares certain students to be qualified in the area they would be participating in [9].

However, learning environment and course organization and intended learning outcome (3.68) rank low and the lowest, counseling (3.67) still rated highly effective. Although counselling ranked the lowest, still there were available staff for consultation whenever needed by the students.

LPU promotes quality education by having counseling and testing center. This is open to all the

students. Counseling is carried out with the assistance of guidance counselors. The guidance counselors assigned for each program regularly monitor the students to assure that they are properly guided psychologically during their academic years. Another counselling effort provided is that the college offers consultation hour by faculty adviser.

The teachers were always there every time needed by the students, may it be for behavioral problem or psychological wellbeing. The school counsellors support and role play in supporting teachers in difficult times because they are knowledgeable on how to embrace the trials of the students as well as give advice to the teachers [10].

Table 2. Effectiveness of OBE Implementation as Assessed by International Hospitality Students

Relevance of the Course	WM	R	WM	R	WM	R	WM	R
	CAKO		HRA		CLOHS		CLOCA	
1. The course helped me to develop relevant subject knowledge.	3.80	1	3.82	1	3.77	1	3.74	1
2. The course helped me to develop related practical skills.	3.73	2	3.80	2	3.74	2	3.70	2
3. The course helped me to develop team working skills.	3.73	4	3.78	4	3.70	4	3.69	4
4. The course helped me to develop leadership skills.	3.69	6	3.74	5	3.61	6	3.66	6
5. The course helped me to develop communication skills.	3.73	2	3.67	6	3.69	5	3.68	5
6. The course helped me to develop positive attitude on my program of study.	3.71	5	3.78	3	3.72	3	3.70	3
Composite Mean	3.73		3.76		3.71		3.69	
Course Organization and ILOs								
1. The course was implemented according to the approved curriculum.	3.72	1	3.74	1	3.67	1	3.66	1
2. Intended learning outcomes (ILOs) of the course were made known from the beginning.	3.69	2	3.70	3	3.63	2	3.63	2
3. Intended learning outcomes (ILOs) of the course were clear.	3.67	3	3.69	4	3.63	2	3.63	3
4. Intended learning outcomes (ILOs) of the course were relevant.	3.66	4	3.72	2	3.61	4	3.63	3
5. There were no overlapping of contents within a course.	3.65	5	3.69	5	3.56	5	3.61	5
Composite Mean	3.68		3.71		3.62		3.63	
Teachers and TLAs								
1. TLAA such as practical, educational tour, etc. were useful and relevant.	3.70	4	3.73	4	3.63	4	3.67	1
2. ILAs such as journal reading, research work, project, etc. were useful and relevant.	3.67	7	3.72	6	3.62	5	3.61	7
3. The TLAs within a course were sequenced in a logical manner.	3.68	6	3.71	7	3.57	7	3.62	6
4. Team teaching is done as applicable.	3.70	5	3.73	4	3.59	6	3.63	5
5. The teachers motivated the students to learn.	3.72	2	3.77	2	3.67	1	3.66	2
6. The teachers provided adequate opportunities for teamwork.	3.73	1	3.75	3	3.63	3	3.65	3
7. The teachers provided adequate opportunities for independent learning.	3.72	3	3.77	1	3.66	2	3.64	4
Composite Mean	3.70		3.74		3.62		3.64	
Assessment								
1. Assessment methods to be used were told at the beginning of the course.	3.72	1	3.76	1	3.64	1.5	3.66	1
2. Assessments covered all the main topics taught in the course.	3.71	3	3.72	3	3.64	1.5	3.64	2
3. The number of assessments was appropriate and adequate.	3.69	6	3.73	2	3.61	3	3.61	5
4. Distribution of assessments over a semester was appropriate.	3.71	4	3.72	5	3.58	6	3.62	4
5. Allocation of marks / grade among assessments was satisfactory.	3.72	2	3.71	6	3.59	4	3.64	3
6. The teachers provided timely feedback on student performance.	3.70	5	3.72	4	3.59	5	3.58	6
Composite Mean	3.71		3.73		3.61		3.62	
Learning environment								
1. Available facilities in the classrooms were satisfactory.	3.72	1	3.72	1	3.58	2	3.56	5
2. Available library facilities were adequate.	3.68	3	3.68	2	3.60	1	3.62	1
3. Available laboratory facilities were adequate.	3.70	2	3.68	2	3.53	5	3.59	2
4. Access to computer facilities were sufficient.	3.67	5	3.63	5	3.56	3	3.57	4
5. There was sufficient access to internet and electronic databases.	3.64	6	3.61	6	3.53	4	3.52	6
6. Availability of facilities for recreation was adequate.	3.68	3	3.64	4	3.52	6	3.58	3
Composite Mean	3.68		3.66		3.55		3.57	
Counselling								
1. The teachers were available for consultation whenever needed.	3.66	3	3.70	1	3.58	1	3.60	1
2. Academic counseling was available when needed.	3.67	1.5	3.66	2.5	3.57	2	3.57	2
3. Counseling on non-academic matters was available when needed.	3.67	1.5	3.66	2.5	3.53	3	3.53	3
Composite Mean	3.67		3.68		3.56		3.57	
Over-all Composite Mean	3.69		3.71		3.61		3.62	

Legend: 3.50 – 4.00 = Highly Effective (HE) ; 2.50 – 3.49 =Effective(E); 1.50 – 2.49 = Less Effective (LE); 1.00 – 1.49 = Not Effective(NE)

As per the assessment of Hotel and Restaurant Administration (HRA) students, they rated the implementation of OBE as highly effective with the over-all composite mean of 3.71. Relevance of the course (3.76) topped on the rank followed by teachers

and teaching-learning activities (3.74) then assessment (3.73). Being enrolled in the specialization of Hotel and Restaurant Administration can help them develop relevant knowledge, practical skills, and positive attitude on the program they were enrolled.

All the professional courses offered are relevant to their field of specialization such front office operations, computer system for front office, food and beverage service operations, beverage products and operations, housekeeping operations, restaurant management and development, hotel management and catering and banquet operations.

Teachers and students were directed in the implementation process by the well-crafted curricula of studies and course syllabi that represent the OBE approach to instruction. Such curricular documents provide both students and teachers with a sense of direction towards achieving the desired learning results. These curriculars may not be perfect to fulfil students' professional needs, but at least their existence may serve as aids in the process of implementation [11].

However, course organization and Intended learning outcomes (3.71) and counselling (3.68) ranked low and the lowest was learning environment (3.66). Although learning environment was rated the lowest, they still assessed that they are satisfied with the available facilities in the classroom, adequate facilities in the library and laboratory as well.

Student-centered environment is a learning environment where a great deal of power lies with students throughout the experience. Educators must ensure that skill and competency-based learning excels with the use of student-centered facilitation techniques. Students should be at the heart of a forward-looking academic learning system and foster learning that is output-driven, outcome-driven and value-congruent in order to encourage educational students to take responsibility for creating a sustainable future [12]. Outcomes-based activities have been substantially carried out to strengthen teaching and learning. These are what the students at the end of a class, lecture, assignment, or program are supposed to do. Activities were intended to classify fields or activities relevant to the course in which evidence or degrees of strengths and deficiencies are more likely to manifest.

Cruiseline Operation in Culinary Arts (CLOCA) students assessed the implementation of OBE as highly effective with the over-all composite mean of 3.62. Relevance of the course (3.69) ranked first followed by teachers and teaching-learning activities (3.64) and course organization and Intended learning outcomes (3.63). The course helps the students to develop relevant subject knowledge, related practical skills and positive attitude on the program study.

Cruise line Operation and Culinary Arts offer courses that are relevant to their specialization such as culinary nutrition, principles of safety hygiene and sanitation, food and beverage service operations, food and beverage control, introduction to pastry and bakery, western cuisine, Asian cuisine, advance patisserie and plated dessert, catering and banquet operations, vegetable and fruit carving, introduction to cruise line industry, basic safety, and crowd crisis control. These courses are significant to attain the desired outcomes for the hospitality program.

The design of the program must be a consistent description of significant learning to be accomplished by students. It is possible to make important educational choices by tracking this desired end-result and understanding enabling results that will help learners achieve greater long-term results [13].

However, assessment (3.62) ranked low and tied on the lowest rank are learning environment (3.57) and counselling (3.57) but still highly effective. Students of Cruiseline Operation in Culinary Arts rated counselling as the lowest but there are teachers who were available for academic consultation and counselling on non-academic matters. With these assessments of the students, it is important to come up with a program that will address the need of the students in counseling to achieve balance in their academic life.

College years might be hard but this part of life that serves as practice for future life after academics and on to adulthood might take young adults to learn to balance academic, financial, social, and health related matters. It will teach them how to balance everything as a young adult to prepare for the next chapters of life [14].

Cruiseline Operation in Hotel Services (CLOHS) students assessed the implementation of OBE as highly effective having over-all composite mean of 3.61. Relevance of the course (3.71) topped the rank while course organization and Intended learning outcomes (3.62) and teachers and teaching-learning activities (3.62) tied on the second rank.

The course helped the CLOHS students to develop relevant subject knowledge, related practical skills and positive attitude on the program study. Cruise line Operation and Hotel Services offers courses that are relevant to their specialization such as principles of safety hygiene and sanitation, food and beverage service operations, front office operations, computer system for front office, beverage products and operations, housekeeping operations, restaurant

management and development, hotel management, catering and banquet operations, introduction to cruise line industry, basic safety, and crowd crisis control.

The outcome of learning is emphasized and defined in advance in the process of designing the program curriculum and what is expected from the learning after the students have graduated to equip them with the requisite skills and abilities before they enter the workplace, then go backwards with curriculum design, program outcomes and course outcomes [15].

However, assessment (3.61) and counselling (3.56) ranked low and lowest on the rank was learning environment (3.55). There are adequate facilities and books in the library, students are satisfied with the facilities in their classroom and have sufficient computer facilities and internet connectivity. Though these are provided, still students considered it lacking or facilities need upgrade specifically with Wi-Fi connection in the whole campus which can help students to add more knowledge in their program specialization.

Academic success of scholars is influenced by their learning environments. The expectations of the learners of their learning environment varied with their study years, age, and gender. It indicates the elements of the learning environment that educators can exploit to enhance their students' performance. It still appears that the study of the learning environment of students is largely unexplored [16].

Table 3. Summary Table on Effectiveness of OBE Implementation

	WM	VI	Rank
Relevance of the Course	3.71	HE	1
Course Organization and ILOs	3.65	HE	4.5
Teachers and TLAs	3.67	HE	2
Assessment	3.66	HE	3
Learning environment	3.61	HE	6
Counselling	3.65	HE	4.5
Composite Mean	3.66	HE	

Legend: 3.50 – 4.00 = Highly Effective (HE); 2.50 – 3.49 = Effective (E); 1.50 – 2.49 = Less Effective (LE); 1.00 – 1.49 = Not Effective (NE)

Table 3 presents the summary of the result on the effectiveness of the implementation of OBE with the composite mean of 3.66 meaning that the implementation of OBE in all the programs in CITHM are highly effective. Relevance of the course (3.71) ranked first followed by teachers and teaching-learning activities (3.67) and third was assessment (3.66). All Hospitality Management programs assessed relevance

of the course as the top indicator in OBE but for Tourism Management programs, it was only the second rank.

This means that all the students of IHM agree that all the lessons provided by the faculty members are very relevant to the courses offered in their program such as food preparation, front office, and other professional courses.

Specific teaching goals and predefined standards will motivate students to become smart investors in their future by becoming imaginative and inventive thinkers for a good OBE implementation. Teachers must use a variety of teaching strategies, both direct and 'student-centered' for good learning to take place; provide students with a variety of opportunities to practice new knowledge; help students bring each learning episode to personal closure to show them where this new profound knowledge will lead. All educating and learning exercises must be related to program goals and course goals [17].

However, course organization and intended learning objectives (3.65) and counselling (3.65) ranked low and learning environment (3.61) ranked the lowest. Among the programs, CLOHS, CLOCA and HRA assessed learning environment as the lowest, but Tourism Management students assessed learning environment as the highest. Among the items cited, students considered internet connectivity as very important because as members of Generation Z, they are really into gadgets and what motivates them is to have real time connectivity to be the first to know the trend. Students' motivation is affected by its learning environment. It was found out that in this learning context, the students had high achievement and low performance targets. The motivation of students in the active learning setting was greater than or comparable to other classes. Such studies indicate that the active learning environment has had a positive effect on the motivation students [18].

Table 4 presents the comparison of responses on the effectiveness of OBE when grouped according to program. It was observed that there was a significant difference since the obtained p-values were all less than the alpha level of 0.05. This means that the responses differ significantly and based on the pairwise comparison, it was found out that HRA considered the OBE most effective compared to the other programs. Students assess the implementation of OBE differently because each of the programs has different courses and different year levels. The respondents are from 1st year to fourth year levels.

Table 4. Difference of Responses on the Effectiveness of OBE when Grouped According to Program/Specialization

	Program	Mean Rank	λ^2_c	p-value	VI
Relevance of the Course	CAKO	1803.84	19.35	0.001	HS
	ITTM	1668.79			
	HRA	1868.35			
	CLOCA	1717.54			
	CLOHS	1700.81			
Course Organization and ILOs	CAKO	1808.47	19.19	0.001	HS
	ITTM	1683.63			
	HRA	1873.00			
	CLOCA	1694.11			
	CLOHS	1674.34			
Teachers and TLAs	CAKO	1842.03	35.98	0.000	HS
	ITTM	1669.01			
	HRA	1928.10			
	CLOCA	1693.22			
	CLOHS	1636.45			
Assessment	CAKO	1873.59	41.05	0.000	HS
	ITTM	1666.23			
	HRA	1922.23			
	CLOCA	1684.06			
	CLOHS	1635.00			
Learning environment	CAKO	1911.16	36.16	0.000	HS
	ITTM	1676.58			
	HRA	1865.52			
	CLOCA	1674.50			
	CLOHS	1629.84			
Counselling	CAKO	1870.55	33.95	0.000	HS
	ITTM	1689.81			
	HRA	1885.10			
	CLOCA	1655.77			
	CLOHS	1636.67			

Legend: Significant at p-value < 0.05

Some of the courses are offered across all programs like computer system for front office, front office operations, housekeeping operations, food and beverage service operation, as well as beverage product operations. Students take these courses, but different programs provide different levels of relevance. What makes difference is that HRA program has lesser laboratory subjects, or they seldom use the kitchen laboratory.

As a multidisciplinary field, hospitality education brings the perspectives of many disciplines, especially those found in the social sciences, to the fields of implementation and practice in the hospitality and tourism industries. The numerous field requirements have led to various kinds of specific programs in which students develop their multidisciplinary skills to excel in this industry [19].

CONCLUSIONS

All CITHM students participants assessed the implementation of Outcomes Based Education as highly effective in the aspects of relevance of the course specifically in the indicator the course helped the student developed relevant subject. For teachers and teaching-learning activities, teachers motivated the students to learn according to the assessment of ITTM and CLOHS programs. Highly significant difference was obtained in the assessment of effectiveness of OBE when grouped according to program/specialization and found that HRA considered the implementation most effective.

RECOMMENDATIONS

Faculty members are encouraged to continuously attend trainings and seminars to be updated in the current trends and knowledge to impart their learnings to tourism and hospitality students. For HRA students, they may be given a separate orientation regarding the differences of the courses offered to each program to discuss with them that the college provides what is required from the curriculum. This study is limited to the assessment of OBE in the course, teachers, assessment, learning environment and counselling. For future researchers, they may assess the effectiveness of outcomes based education in the areas of instruction and on the job training when the instruction resumes to the traditional to face to face. Assessment of the implementation of OBE may also be conducted in the next years to compare the result of each year.

REFERENCES

- [1] Katawazai, R., (2021). Implementing Outcomes Based education and student centered learning in Afghan public universities: the current practices and challenges. *Heliyon* 7(5)
- [2] Baguio, J. (2019) Outcomes-based education: teachers' attitude and implementation, *University of Bohol Multidisciplinary Research*, 7, 110-127
- [3] Jadhav, M. R., Kakade, A. B., Jagtap, S. R., & Patil, M. S. (2020). Impact assessment of outcome based approach in engineering education in India. *Procedia Computer Science*, 172, 791-796
- [4] Tan, K., Chong, M. C., Subramaniam, P., & Wong, L. P. (2018). The effectiveness of outcome-based education on the competencies

- of nursing students: A systematic review. *Nurse education today*, 64, 180-189
- [5] Jain, S. (2016). Outcomes-Based Education: Need Of Present Scenario. *Journal of Innovative Research and Development* 1(2), 18-24
- [6] Delos Reyes, Z., Liber R., and Zara, C. (2019). Barriers of Outcomes-Based Education (OBE) Implementation. *IOER International Multidisciplinary Research Journal*
- [7] Khannaa, R., & Mehrotrab, D. (2019) The roadmap for quality improvement from traditional through competency based (CBE) towards outcome based education (OBE) in dentistry. *Journal of Oral Biology and Craniofacial Research* 9(2)139-142
- [8] Kyauta, A. M. A., Shariff, Y. A., & Garba, H. S. (2018). The role of guidance and counseling service on academic performance among students of umarsuleiman college of education, Gashua, Yobe State, Nigeria. *KIU Journal of Humanities*, 2(2) (B), 59-66.
- [9] Zain, N. M., Hadi A. A., & Hamid K. A. (2016) Outcome Based Education: A Perception from Private Health Sciences Graduating scholars in Malaysia. *European Journal of Educational Studies* 2(6)
- [10] Kourkoutas, E., Hart, A., Graaf, U., & Kassis, W. (2017). A resilience-based program to promote reflective and inclusive teaching practices in Greece during austerity. *Teacher professional knowledge and development for reflective and inclusive practices*, 168-178.
- [11] Iringan, E. M., & Bansig, I. C. (2019) Implementation of Outcomes—Based Education in the Graduate School Level at St. Paul University Philippines. *World Journal of Educational Research*, 6(2)
- [12] De Guzman, M. D. (2016). Preferred Student-Centered Strategies in Teacher Education: Input to Outcomes-Based Instruction. *Asia Pacific Journal of Education, Arts and Sciences*, 3, 40–46.
- [13] Abu Bakar, N. & Rosbi, S. (2019) Framework of Outcome-Based-Education (OBE) for Massive Open Online Courses (MOOCs) in Islamic Finance Education. *International Journal of Advanced Engineering Research and Science (IJAERS)* 6(10)
- [14] Baldwin, D. R., Towler, K., Oliver, M. D., & Datta, S. (2017). An examination of college student wellness: A research and liberal arts perspective. *Health Psychology Open*, 4(2),
- [15] Alipio, M. M. (2020) Predicting Academic Performance of College Freshmen in the Philippines using Psychological Variables & Expectancy-Value Beliefs to Outcomes-Based Education: A Path Analysis. <https://doi.org/10.35542/osf.io/pr6z>
- [16] Jamshidi, N., Molazem, Z., Sharif, F., Torabizadeh, C., & Najafi Kalyani, M. (2016). The challenges of nursing students in the clinical learning environment: A qualitative study. *The Scientific World Journal*
- [17] Yusof, R., Othman, N., Norwani, N. M., Ahmad, N. L. B., & Jalil, N. B. A. (2017). Implementation Of Outcome-Based Education (OBE) In Accounting Programme In Higher Education. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 7(6)
- [18] Cicuto, C. A. T., & Torres, B. B. (2016). Implementing an active learning environment to influence students' motivation in biochemistry. *Journal of Chemical Education*, 93(6), 1020-1026.
- [19] Angelo, T. A., & Cross, K. P. (2012). Classroom Assessment Techniques. Hoboken, NJ: Jossey Bass Wiley

COPYRIGHTS

Copyright of this article is retained by the author/s, with first publication rights granted to APJEP. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4>).